

## ■ algorithm for generating $\mathcal{F}[S]$

```
Needs["DiscreteMath`Combinatorica`"]
P1[S_] := Flatten[Join[Table[KSubsets[S, i], {i, 1, Length[S]}], 1];
P2[S_] :=
  Flatten[Permutations /@ Select[KSubsets[P1[S], 2], Length[(#1[[1]] &cap; (#1[[2]])] == 0 &], 1];
f[{s1_, s2_}] := F[And@@s1, And@@s2];
F[S_] := f /@ P2[S];
```

## ■ examples

```
F[{p, q}] // TraditionalForm
```

```
{F(p, q), F(q, p)}
```

```
F[{p, q, r}] // TraditionalForm
```

```
{F(p, q), F(q, p), F(p, r), F(r, p), F(p, q &and; r), F(q &and; r, p), F(q, r), F(r, q), F(q, p &and; r), F(p &and; r, q), F(r, p &and; q), F(p &and; q, r)}
```

```
F[{p, q, r, s}] // TraditionalForm
```

```
{F(p, q), F(q, p), F(p, r), F(r, p), F(p, s), F(s, p), F(p, q &and; r), F(q &and; r, p), F(p, q &and; s), F(q &and; s, p), F(p, r &and; s), F(r &and; s, p),
  F(p, q &and; r &and; s), F(q &and; r &and; s, p), F(q, r), F(r, q), F(q, s), F(s, q), F(q, p &and; r), F(p &and; r, q), F(q, p &and; s), F(p &and; s, q), F(q, r &and; s),
  F(r &and; s, q), F(q, p &and; r &and; s), F(p &and; r &and; s, q), F(r, s), F(s, r), F(r, p &and; q), F(p &and; q, r), F(r, p &and; s), F(p &and; s, r), F(r, q &and; s),
  F(q &and; s, r), F(r, p &and; q &and; s), F(p &and; q &and; s, r), F(s, p &and; q), F(p &and; q, s), F(s, p &and; r), F(p &and; r, s), F(s, q &and; r), F(q &and; r, s),
  F(s, p &and; q &and; r), F(p &and; q &and; r, s), F(p &and; q, r &and; s), F(r &and; s, p &and; q), F(p &and; r, q &and; s), F(q &and; s, p &and; r), F(p &and; s, q &and; r), F(q &and; r, p &and; s)}
```

```
Table[Length[F[Range[n]]], {n, 2, 10}]
```

```
{2, 12, 50, 180, 602, 1932, 6050, 18660, 57002}
```

## ■ Adding T to a (contingent) coherent set of size 2 can never yield an incoherent set

Here's  $\mathcal{F}\{p, q, T\}$ :

```
F[{p, q, T}] // TraditionalForm
```

```
{F(p, q), F(q, p), F(p, T), F(T, p), F(p, q &and; T), F(q &and; T, p), F(q, T), F(T, q), F(q, p &and; T), F(p &and; T, q), F(T, p &and; q), F(p &and; q, T)}
```

Any term of the form  $F[_ , T]$  will be zero, by the definition of  $F$ . So,

```
% // . F[x_, T] -> 0 // TraditionalForm
```

```
{F(p, q), F(q, p), 0, F(T, p), F(p, q &and; T), F(q &and; T, p), 0, F(T, q), F(q, p &and; T), F(p &and; T, q), F(T, p &and; q), 0}
```

Moreover, any conjunction of the form  $X \&\& T$  can be rewritten as  $X$ , since it is logically equivalent to  $X$ :

```
% // . x_ && T -> x // TraditionalForm
```

```
{F(p, q), F(q, p), 0, F(T, p), F(p, q), F(q, p), 0, F(T, q), F(q, p), F(p, q), F(T, p &and; q), 0}
```

Finally, any term of the form  $F[T, _]$  will be 1, by the definition of  $F$ :

```
% // . F[T, x_] → 1 // TraditionalForm
{F(p, q), F(q, p), 0, 1, F(p, q), F(q, p), 0, 1, F(q, p), F(p, q), 1, 0}
```

Now, we can take the Mean, to yield  $C(\{p,q,T\})$ :

```
Mean[%] // TraditionalForm
 $\frac{1}{12} (3 F(p, q) + 3 F(q, p) + 3)$ 
```

Now, let's compare this with  $C(\{p,q\})$ :

```
Mean[ $\mathcal{F}[\{p, q\}]$ ] // TraditionalForm
 $\frac{1}{2} (F(p, q) + F(q, p))$ 
```

The following proves that If  $C(\{p,q\}) \geq 0$ , then  $C(\{p,q,T\}) \geq 0$ .

```
Needs["Algebra`InequalitySolve`"]
InequalitySolve[ $\frac{x}{2} \geq 0 \ \&\& \ \frac{1}{12} (3 x + 3) < 0 \ \&\& \ -2 \leq x \leq 2, \{x\}$ ]
False
```

### ■ Adding T to a (contingent) coherent set of size 3 can never yield an incoherent set

```
 $\mathcal{F}[\{p, q, r, T\}]$  // TraditionalForm
{F(p, q), F(q, p), F(p, r), F(r, p), F(p, T), F(T, p), F(p, q ∧ r), F(q ∧ r, p), F(p, q ∧ T), F(q ∧ T, p), F(p, r ∧ T), F(r ∧ T, p),
F(p, q ∧ r ∧ T), F(q ∧ r ∧ T, p), F(q, r), F(r, q), F(q, T), F(T, q), F(q, p ∧ r), F(p ∧ r, q), F(q, p ∧ T), F(p ∧ T, q), F(q, r ∧ T),
F(r ∧ T, q), F(q, p ∧ r ∧ T), F(p ∧ r ∧ T, q), F(r, T), F(T, r), F(r, p ∧ q), F(p ∧ q, r), F(r, p ∧ T), F(p ∧ T, r), F(r, q ∧ T),
F(q ∧ T, r), F(r, p ∧ q ∧ T), F(p ∧ q ∧ T, r), F(T, p ∧ q), F(p ∧ q, T), F(T, p ∧ r), F(p ∧ r, T), F(T, q ∧ r), F(q ∧ r, T),
F(T, p ∧ q ∧ r), F(p ∧ q ∧ r, T), F(p ∧ q, r ∧ T), F(r ∧ T, p ∧ q), F(p ∧ r, q ∧ T), F(q ∧ T, p ∧ r), F(p ∧ T, q ∧ r), F(q ∧ r, p ∧ T)}
```

```
% // . F[x_, T] → 0 // TraditionalForm
{F(p, q), F(q, p), F(p, r), F(r, p), 0, F(T, p), F(p, q ∧ r), F(q ∧ r, p), F(p, q ∧ T), F(q ∧ T, p), F(p, r ∧ T),
F(r ∧ T, p), F(p, q ∧ r ∧ T), F(q ∧ r ∧ T, p), F(q, r), F(r, q), 0, F(T, q), F(q, p ∧ r), F(p ∧ r, q), F(q, p ∧ T),
F(p ∧ T, q), F(q, r ∧ T), F(r ∧ T, q), F(q, p ∧ r ∧ T), F(p ∧ r ∧ T, q), 0, F(T, r), F(r, p ∧ q), F(p ∧ q, r), F(r, p ∧ T),
F(p ∧ T, r), F(r, q ∧ T), F(q ∧ T, r), F(r, p ∧ q ∧ T), F(p ∧ q ∧ T, r), F(T, p ∧ q), 0, F(T, p ∧ r), 0, F(T, q ∧ r), 0,
F(T, p ∧ q ∧ r), 0, F(p ∧ q, r ∧ T), F(r ∧ T, p ∧ q), F(p ∧ r, q ∧ T), F(q ∧ T, p ∧ r), F(p ∧ T, q ∧ r), F(q ∧ r, p ∧ T)}
```

```
% // . x_ && T → x // TraditionalForm
{F(p, q), F(q, p), F(p, r), F(r, p), 0, F(T, p), F(p, q ∧ r), F(q ∧ r, p), F(p, q), F(q, p), F(p, r), F(r, p), F(p, q ∧ r), F(q ∧ r, p),
F(q, r), F(r, q), 0, F(T, q), F(q, p ∧ r), F(p ∧ r, q), F(q, p), F(p, q), F(q, r), F(r, q), F(q, p ∧ r), F(p ∧ r, q), 0,
F(T, r), F(r, p ∧ q), F(p ∧ q, r), F(r, p), F(p, r), F(r, q), F(q, r), F(r, p ∧ q), F(p ∧ q, r), F(T, p ∧ q), 0, F(T, p ∧ r),
0, F(T, q ∧ r), 0, F(T, p ∧ q ∧ r), 0, F(p ∧ q, r), F(r, p ∧ q), F(p ∧ r, q), F(q, p ∧ r), F(p, q ∧ r), F(q ∧ r, p)}
```

```
% // . F[T, x_] -> 1 // TraditionalForm
{F(p, q), F(q, p), F(p, r), F(r, p), 0, 1, F(p, q & r), F(q & r, p), F(p, q), F(q, p), F(p, r), F(r, p),
 F(p, q & r), F(q & r, p), F(q, r), F(r, q), 0, 1, F(q, p & r), F(p & r, q), F(q, p), F(p, q), F(q, r), F(r, q),
 F(q, p & r), F(p & r, q), 0, 1, F(r, p & q), F(p & q, r), F(r, p), F(p, r), F(r, q), F(q, r), F(r, p & q),
 F(p & q, r), 1, 0, 1, 0, 1, 0, 1, 0, F(p & q, r), F(r, p & q), F(p & r, q), F(q, p & r), F(p, q & r), F(q & r, p)}
```

```
Mean[%] // TraditionalForm
```

$$\frac{1}{50} (3 F(p, q) + 3 F(p, r) + 3 F(p, q \wedge r) + 3 F(q, p) + 3 F(q, r) + 3 F(q, p \wedge r) + 3 F(r, p) + 3 F(r, q) + 3 F(r, p \wedge q) + 3 F(p \wedge q, r) + 3 F(p \wedge r, q) + 3 F(q \wedge r, p) + 7)$$

```
Mean[ $\mathcal{F}$  [{p, q, r}]] // TraditionalForm
```

$$\frac{1}{12} (F(p, q) + F(p, r) + F(p, q \wedge r) + F(q, p) + F(q, r) + F(q, p \wedge r) + F(r, p) + F(r, q) + F(r, p \wedge q) + F(p \wedge q, r) + F(p \wedge r, q) + F(q \wedge r, p))$$

The following proves that if  $C(\{p, q, r\}) \geq 0$ , then  $C(\{p, q, r, T\}) \geq 0$ .

```
Needs["Algebra`InequalitySolve`"]
```

```
InequalitySolve[ $\frac{x}{12} \geq 0 \ \&\& \ \frac{1}{50} (3x + 7) < 0 \ \&\& \ -12 \leq x \leq 12, \{x\}$ ]
```

```
False
```

This can easily be generalized to an inductive proof, for all  $n$ .

But, we can still have the coherence being DECREASED when we add a tautology. This is seen in the following result ( $n = 2$  case):

```
In[26]:= InequalitySolve[ $\frac{x}{2} > \frac{1}{12} (3x + 3) \ \&\& \ -2 \leq x \leq 2, \{x\}$ ]
```

```
Out[26]= 1 < x ≤ 2
```

This is an artifact of the *averaging* in the definition. If we just take the *sum* of the  $F$ -values, then this cannot happen. In the  $n = 2$  case:

$$C(\{p, q\}) = F(p, q) + F(q, p)$$

$$C(\{p, q, T\}) = 3 F(p, q) + 3 F(q, p) + 3 = 3 [C(\{p, q\}) + 1]$$